IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE MIDDLE DISTRICT OF NORTH CAROLINA DURHAM DIVISION

Civil Action No: 1:08-CV-0854

| DUKE UNIVERSITY; DUKE | |
|---------------------------|--------------------------|
| UNIVERSITY HEALTH SYSTEM, |) |
| INC., |) |
| |) |
| Plaintiffs, |) |
| |) PLAINTIFFS' MOTION TO |
| V. |) PROCEED WITH DISCOVERY |
| |) |
| NATIONAL UNION FIRE |) |
| INSURANCE COMPANY OF |) |
| PITTSBURGH, PA., |) |

Defendant.

NOW COMES Plaintiffs Duke University and Duke University Health System,. Inc. ("Duke"), through counsel and pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(d), and respectfully moves this Court to proceed with discovery in this action, stating as follows:

1. This is an insurance coverage action brought by Duke against its insurer, National Union Fire Insurance Company of Pittsburgh, P.A ("National Union"). On November 24, 2008, Duke filed its Complaint against National Union, seeking payment of defense and indemnity costs from National Union in connection with certain claims made against Duke by individuals affiliated with the Duke University 2005-2006 Men's Lacrosse Team.

US2008 868563.1

- 2. On January 16, 2009, National Union filed an Answer and Counterclaims against Duke. Further, National Union filed a Third-Party Complaint against third party United Educators Insurance ("United Educators"), seeking contribution and/or subrogation from United Educators [Dkt. 8].
- 3. In March 2009, United Educators filed a Motion to Dismiss the Third-Party Complaint filed against it by National Union, arguing lack of subject matter jurisdiction and/or failure to state a claim under Fed. R. Civ. P. 12(b)(6).
- 4. Although Duke filed its lawsuit against National Union in November 2008, no discovery in this action has commenced to date, presumably because Third-Party Defendant United Educators has filed a motion to dismiss, which motion has not yet been reached by this Court.
- 5. Regardless of the outcome of United Educators' Motion to Dismiss, the underlying claims between Duke and National Union will move forward and will be subject to evidentiary discovery under the Federal Rules. Thus, allowing discovery to move forward between Duke and National Union at present will advance this litigation without posing any risks of inefficiency or unnecessary use of judicial resources.
- 6. There exists good cause for discovery to proceed forthwith between Duke and National Union.
- 7. In support of this motion, Duke is submitting herewith a Memorandum of Law in Support of its Motion to Proceed with Discovery.

Respectfully submitted this the 18th day of September, 2009.

KILPATRICK STOCKTON LLP

/s/ Gregg E. McDougal_

Gregg E. McDougal N.C. State Bar No. 27290 gmcdougal@kilpatrickstockton.com 3737 Glenwood Avenue, Suite 400 Raleigh, NC 27612 Phone (919) 420-1800 Fax (919) 420-1700

JENNER & BLOCK LLP

Jerold Oshinsky joshinsky@jenner.com 633 West 5th Street, Suite 3500 Los Angeles, CA 90071-2054 Phone (213) 239-5100

Attorneys for Plaintiffs Duke University and Duke University Health System, Inc.

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that the foregoing was filed with the Court using the CM/ECF system which will automatically send notice to the following counsel of record:

BAILEY & DIXON, LLP

David S. Coats dcoats@bdixon.com

John T. Crook jcrook@bdixon.com

SMITH, ANDERSON, BLOUNT, DORSETT, MITCHELL, AND JERNIGAN LLP

James Kye Dorsett, III jdorsett@smithlaw.com

Kirk Alan Parry, Jr. aparry@smithlaw.com

And via first-class mail, postage prepaid, to the following non-CM/ECF participants:

CROWELL & MORING, LLP

Clifton S. Elgarten Elaine Panagakos Kathryn Underhill Michael T. Carolan 1001 Pennsylvania Ave., N.W. Washington, DC 20004

This 18th day of September, 2009.

/s/ John M. Moye

John M. Moye

KILPATRICK STOCKTON LLP 3737 GLENWOOD AVENUE SUITE 400 RALEIGH, NC 27612